This is not an ADB material. The views expressed in this document are the views of the author/s and/or their organizations and do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the Asian Development Bank, or its Board of Governors, or the governments they represent. ADB does not guarantee the accuracy and/or completeness of the material's contents, and accepts no responsibility for any direct or indirect consequence of their use or reliance, whether wholly or partially. Please feel free to contact the authors directly should you have queries.

## Inclusive skill-building: potential impact & approaches

Asian Development Bank Skills Forum

Presentation 11 December 2013

CONFIDENTIAL AND PROPRIETARY Any use of this material without specific permission of McKinsey & Company is strictly prohibited

McKinsey&Company

## For many developing countries, improving labor productivity is critical to raising living standards

|                | Per capita GDP<br>2010 \$ thousand | Employed share of<br>population<br>% B | Labour productivity<br>2010 \$ thousand per<br>worker |  |
|----------------|------------------------------------|--|---|--|
| - Poland       | 9.9                                | 41                                     | 24.1  |  |
| Mexico         | 8.2                                | 39                                     | 21.1  |  |
| 💽 Turkey       | 7.3                                | 30                                     | 24.4  |  |
| 🕌 Malaysia     | 6.5                                | 43                                     | 15.2  |  |
| 😈 Russia       | 6.4                                | 47                                     | 13.5  |  |
| 🥪 South Africa | 5.9                                | 37                                     | 15.9  |  |
| 📀 Brazil       | 5.5                                | 51                                     | 10.9  |  |
| 🛑 Thailand     | 3.2                                | 57                                     | 5.5   |  |
| China 🔴        | 2.9                                | 57                                     | 5.1   |  |
| endonesia      | 1.6                                | 45                                     | 3.5   |  |
| 💿 India        | 1.1                                | 40                                     | 2.7   |  |
| 😡 Vietnam      | 0.8                                | 55                                     | 1.5   |  |

SOURCE: Economist Intelligence Unit, Conference Board, McKinsey Global Institute analysis

## India's aggregate labor productivity is held back by the high share of workers in low-productivity agriculture

### Productivity & employment by sector

2010



### Giving workers the skills to move to working in non-farm sectors can result in a significant uplift in incomes

#### Wages for salaried workers

INR per day, 2010





### Technology holds the promise to access more pupils at lower cost

- Using technology for 'hybrid' delivery models combination of classroom teaching and distance learning (online, TV)
- Leveraging technology to create transparency about labour markets and career planning



### Young people prefer hands-on learning, but not many providers are geared to deliver this – hybrid models are necessary Use of hands-on learning in

Most effective instructional techniques<sup>1</sup>

% of respondents saving technique is effective

## vocational institutions<sup>2</sup>

% of respondents indicating a majority of hours spent in learning methodology



- 1 Now I'm going to read out a number of different instructional techniques. I want you to rate how effective each technique is for your learning, using a 11-point scale, where 0 means the technique is not at all effective and 10 means the technique is very effective. If you have not been exposed to this technique, please respond "no exposure."
- 2 On average, how much time did you spend in your academic program engaged in practical, hands-on learning versus theoretical learning? Please think about this in the context of every 10 hours you spent learning and indicate how many of those hours were practical (e.g., on-thejob training, simulations, etc.) and how many were theoretical (in the classroom).

SOURCE: McKinsey survey, Aug-Sept 2012, "Education to Employment: Making the system work", McKinsey & Company, 2012

# Anhanguera in Brazil has used technology in a hybrid model to increase reach, profitably



| Anhanguera, Brazil: Distance learning at scale    |   |  |  |  |
|---|---|--|--|--|
| Context of<br>vocational<br>training in<br>Brazil | <ul> <li>Significant shortfall (60%) in number and quality of teachers</li> <li>Largely fragmented and low-scale private market</li> <li>Prohibitive cost of delivery of education to cities below 100,000 students</li> <li>Massive regulatory push (e.g., explicit targets for net enrolment rate of 33% + in higher education)</li> </ul>  |  |  |  |
| Approach  | <ul> <li>Offers "hybrid programs" that reach small cities         <ul> <li>Students attend a "learning center" 1-2 days each week to watch lectures broadcast from a central location</li> <li>Local professors lead students through exercises and discussion</li> <li>Complete online learning on their own schedule for rest of the week</li> </ul> </li> <li>Offers a mix of 4-year, 2-year, and non-degree programs via this hybrid model at ~60% lower price</li> </ul> |  |  |  |
| Key achieve-<br>ments                             | <ul> <li>Increased reach 10x (from 30 cities to 250+ cities) by adopting hybrid model (studio &amp; satellite)</li> <li>Largest distance learning program for 'working adults' that is profitable: \$200 Mn revenues; 22% EBITDA</li> <li>&gt;500 units/courses offered across business</li> <li>High enrolment to distances learning program: ~150,000 per month; 500 learning centres covering 26 states</li> </ul>   |  |  |  |

SOURCE: Expert interviews, analyst reports, media review



# IL&FS Skills' rural, bottom-of-pyramid skills model is promising – students' opportunity cost is a potential barrier

Case study of IL&FS Skills

| Key success<br>factors               | Description   | IL&FS Skills approach  |                               |  |
|--------------------------------------|---|--|-------------------------------|--|
| Low-cost<br>delivery                 | <ul> <li>Low cost base in<br/>order to ensure<br/>profitability</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>Standardized curriculum</li> <li>Delivery through multimedia<br/>platform (K-Yan)</li> <li>Corporate partners sometimes<br/>provide facilities</li> </ul> | •                             | In 2012, >9,000<br>students were<br>trained with an                    |
| Interactive<br>learning              | <ul> <li>Learning by doing<br/>due to the technical<br/>&amp; vocational nature<br/>of training</li> </ul>                              | <ul> <li>Simulated environments, paired<br/>with classroom instruction, allow<br/>pupils to learn in field-and-forum<br/>way</li> </ul>                            | -                             | 30 students<br>trained per<br>month per<br>center                      |
| Visibility on<br>skills<br>demand    | <ul> <li>Ensuring<br/>participants are<br/>developing skills<br/>that lead to<br/>employment</li> </ul>                                 | <ul> <li>Industry partnerships with 1,000+<br/>employers to ensure relevance of<br/>curriculum and secure<br/>placements for students</li> </ul>                   | Apollo<br>Pharmacy<br>Bazaar* | ~350 centers<br>across 24<br>states<br>~60/40%<br>female-male<br>split |
| Affordability<br>for<br>participants | <ul> <li>Low tuition /<br/>potential<br/>compensation to<br/>pupils to defray<br/>opportunity cost<br/>of training over work</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Ministry of Rural Development<br/>pays for training</li> <li>No benefit yet for pupils to defray<br/>opportunity cost</li> </ul>                          | सत्यमेव जयते                  |  |

SOURCE: Expert interviews, McKinsey Global Institute analysis

# Alternative sources of financing can be considered - payroll tax example to deploy mobile learning units to remote areas



| Overview            | <ul> <li>Created in 1946 as a professional education institution to educate people to carry out activities<br/>in the areas of commercialization of goods, services and tourism</li> </ul>   |  |  |
|---------------------|--|--|--|
|                     | Financed by businesses from relevant sectors who contribute 1% of their payroll  |  |  |
| Delivery<br>methods | <ul> <li>Network of 506 teaching units and 74 mobile road and river units across 3,000 municipalities</li> <li>Methods of delivery</li> </ul>  |  |  |
|                     | <ul> <li>On-site, in person</li> <li>Distance learning</li> </ul>  |  |  |
|                     | <ul> <li>TV network (the Rede Sesc-Senac de Teleconferencia (STV)) transmits material by<br/>satellite TV complemented with real-time interaction via e-mail, fax and telephone</li> </ul>   |  |  |
|                     | Radio program "Sintonia Sesc-Senac"  |  |  |
|                     | Through VHS, CDs and DVDs  |  |  |
|                     | <ul> <li>Semi-distance learning: first phase of in-person education followed by a second phase<br/>of distance learning</li> </ul>   |  |  |
| Mobile              | <ul> <li>SENAC provides training in rural and isolated communities using mobile units ("Senac-<br/>Movel") that remain in each municipality from 6 mo to 1 year</li> </ul>                   |  |  |
| lourning            | <ul> <li>"Sobre Rodas" (Schools on Wheels): 59 road units that operate on vehicles 14 m long and<br/>4 m high and 2.6 m wide, equipped with A/C, computers, VCR, TV and satellite</li> </ul> |  |  |
|                     | <ul> <li>Provide professional training in hotel and tourism, IT, management, personal<br/>presentation skills and health</li> </ul>  |  |  |
|                     | <ul> <li>"Senac sobre as aguas" (Senac on Water): floating units on 3-story floors of 180 m<sup>2</sup> that<br/>provide services to riverside communities</li> </ul>                        |  |  |

SOURCE: EMEA Welfare & Employment KIP team, Berufsbildungsbericht 2006, "CSR in Two Countries: Brazil and Norway," 2008

### A number of stakeholders need to work together to realize the potential of building inclusive skills

| Stakeholder                | Interventions  |    |
|----------------------------|--|----|
|                            | <ul> <li>Apex skills agencies can spearhead the use of<br/>technology and distance learning in vocational training</li> <li>Create centralized repository of online vocational<br/>learning content to enable small players</li> </ul> |    |
| Government<br>Institutions | <ul> <li>Enable government technical institutes' IT<br/>infrastructure to be used by private players</li> </ul>  |    |
| ~                          | <ul> <li>Develop simulation capability for complex trainings to<br/>reduce requirement of physical infrastructure</li> </ul>   |    |
|                            | <ul> <li>Ministries (of HRD, Labour, Education) can allocate a<br/>share of their education budget for technology enabled<br/>vocational training for poor and less accessible communities</li> </ul>                                  |    |
| Tashaslam                  | <ul> <li>Network infrastructure companies can provide<br/>connectivity for vocational training schools</li> </ul>  |    |
| companies                  | <ul> <li>Cloud services providers can build cloud-based scalable<br/>solutions for remote conferencing and collaboration<br/>tools in local languages</li> </ul>   |    |
| Educational                | <ul> <li>Trainers can digitize content consistent with national<br/>vocational qualification &amp; certification standards</li> </ul>  | 1  |
| Institutions               | <ul> <li>Trainers can develop "hybrid" models that leverage online<br/>content and also provide hands-on learning</li> </ul>   | 2  |
| Employers                  | <ul> <li>Companies and MSME associations can gear up for an<br/>e-environment by collaborating to develop simulations,<br/>shaping e-training content</li> </ul>   |    |
|                            | <ul> <li>Payroll tax or a share of mandatory CSR fund pools can<br/>be used for bottom-of-pyramid skills trainers</li> </ul>   | 11 |

## Inclusive skill-building: potential impact & approaches

Asian Development Bank Skills Forum

Presentation 11 December 2013

CONFIDENTIAL AND PROPRIETARY Any use of this material without specific permission of McKinsey & Company is strictly prohibited

McKinsey&Company