

This is not an ADB material. The views expressed in this document are the views of the author/s and/or their organizations and do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the Asian Development Bank, or its Board of Governors, or the governments they represent. ADB does not guarantee the accuracy and/or completeness of the material's contents, and accepts no responsibility for any direct or indirect consequence of their use or reliance, whether wholly or partially. Please feel free to contact the authors directly should you have queries.

Subregional Conference



Gender Equality and Social Inclusion in South Asia: Reflections and Way Forward for ADB

ADB

Paro, Bhutan | 04-07 October, 2022

ADB

Session # 4

Social Identity Groups in South Asia and the Social and Economic Cost of their Exclusion and Discrimination

Dr. Sukhadeo Thorat

Chairperson, Indian Institute of Dalit Studies, Delhi, India

Professor Emeritus, Jawaharlal Nehru University, Delhi, India



Issues for discussion

- Why are we concerned about social exclusion? What is social exclusion?
- Likely economic/social cost of social exclusion/discrimination
- Excluded groups in South Asia and the nature of their exclusion
- Economic/social cost to excluded groups in SA in terms of HD and HP
- Some suggestions for inclusive policies for social identity groups under GESI



Exclusion and Discrimination : Meaning from Theories

Test (Baker, 1956) ,Belief (. Arrow 1970) Identity (Akerlof 2004, 2010),Racial Identity norms (Darity 2006),Identity Economics (2010) ,Ambedkar (1987) Three Nobel L .

SE, Rein Lienor 1970's , Sen (2000 ,ADB) , Bruise (2010) ,Hann Karlson (2008,2010)

Three Features

(a) Group based Identity –Social categories with ascribed status

(b) Embedded in social interrelations, exclusionary Norms , dominant/subordinate, low//high caste, Majority /minority religion , tribal/non-tribal

(c) Exclusion involves the denial of equal rights, opportunities, and status in multiple spheres (economic, political, and civil)

(d) Adverse impact on excluded groups in multiple spheres



Channels through which Exclusion/ Discrimination practiced

Market and Non-market exchanges

- Operate through **markets exchange** - labor, land, capital, credit, capital, and consumer goods & services
- **Non-market exchange**: Govt and govt-approved supplier, health, education, food, public employment
- Lack of **participation** in legislation, policymaking, and implementation of policies
- Lack of civil rights and freedom



Cost to Discriminated and Excluded Groups

Covers all social identity groups but varies across groups, castes, tribes, religious minorities

Cost of Exclusion in past :

- For a long time (till provision in the constitution and laws against discrimination is framed)

Cost of Exclusion in the present:

- Legacy of past exclusion still persists despite laws against discrimination in modified forms.



Cost to Discriminated and Excluded Groups (*continuation*)

- **Exclusion and denial of economic/social rights result in**
 - Low ownership of capital assets
 - Low-quality employment
 - Low education and skill, high illiteracy, and low employability
 - Poor access to social networks and information
 - Lack of participation in governance, laws and policymaking and implementation
 - Forced inclusion as casual/forced/attached/slave labor



Cost to Discriminated and Excluded Groups (*continuation*)

- **Costs of *persisting* discrimination in the present despite legal safeguards**

- Exclusion in some spheres of market exchange
- Inclusion in the market with discrimination
- Exclusion/Inclusion covers labour, land, enterprises, factors/consumer good market, capital, services
- Non –Market Exchange, govt and govt-approved institutions, public employment, food, education, health, and others
- Segregation: social and physical; poor civic amenities



Cost to Discriminated and Excluded Groups (*continuation*)

- **Outcomes of past and present exclusion and discrimination)**
 - Asset lessness: landlessness, low enterprises, high illiteracy, low employability
 - Low income, high poverty, malnutrition, and poor health
 - Low life expectancy, low HDI & high HPI
 - Low participation in law/policy making and implementation
 - Residential and social segregation
 - Less access to social/information network



Social Identity Groups in South Asia

- **India:** Castes, tribal, religious minorities
- **Nepal:** Caste, Janjati, religious minorities
- **Sri Lanka:** Caste, Dalits from Sinhala -Sinhala Tamil -Indian Tamil; religious minorities: Muslims, Christians
- **Bangladesh:** Dalit Hindu and Dalit Muslims, Tribal/Indigenous
- Religious minorities: Hindu, Christians, Buddhists



Social Identity Groups in South Asia

- **Castes** cut across SAC: (Ex. Untouchables) India, Nepal, Sri Lanka, Bangladesh
- **Tribes/Janjati**: India, Nepal, Bangladesh, and Sri Lanka
- **Religious minorities**:
 - **Muslims**: India, Nepal, Sri Lanka
 - **Hindu**: Bangladesh, Sri Lanka
 - **Christians**: India, Sri Lanka, Nepal, Bangladesh
 - **Buddhists**: India, Nepal, Bangladesh,
 - **Sikh/Jain**: India



Intersectionality

- **Intersectionality:**
- **Caste/Tribal /religious groups vis-vis Gender/** ,Women from low caste /tribal /religious minorities background face both **gender and caste/religious/ethnic discrimination**
- **Caste /religion:** low caste in minority religion face **caste as well as religious** discrimination



Status of Social Identity Groups

- IIDS STUDY 2010, ADB Recent , ILO 2020 ,
- Lack of studies , Data is issue
- **India:** Disparities between SC/HC, ST/Non-ST, Muslim / other minorities /Hindu majority (Thorat)
- **Nepal :** Disparities between Dalit and HC, and Janjati/Indigenous /others
- **Bangladesh :** Dalit Hindu /Muslim lack much behind others (Iftkar Chaudary), Hindu lack behind Muslim
- **Sri Lanka :** Dalit lack behind all groups (udur Silva)



Policies for Inclusion: Insight from theories

- Taste : competitive market, no interference
- Belief : Perfect and cost-effective information
- **Identity Theory** : **Reforms in ideas /norms**

Affirmative Action Policies fair share

- Identity Norm Theory: **Reparation and Affirmative Action**
- Ambedkar: **legal, Reservation, Reparation**



Lessons from Theories for Inclusion of some aspects in GFSI -ADB

(b) **GESI Focus on outcomes** and improvement through policies and projects,

- in spheres, such as health, education, jobs, security, civic amenities,
- indicators for monitoring to assess outcomes

(b) **Focus on sources of poor outcomes also needed**

What distinguishes excluded from non-excluded groups is discrimination and poor endowment for the cause of poor human development or high human poverty outcome.



Share of Discrimination and Endowment in Gap SC/HC: Case of India

*Income (2012)

- 61%
- 39%

Farming (2014)

- 63%
- 37%

• Employment (2017-18)

- 27%
- 73%

• Employment: Public

- 60%
- 40%

• Employment: Private

- 47%
- 53%

• Wage (2017-18)

- 57%
- 43%



Excluded Groups need dual policies

Affirmative Actions for non-discriminatory access and fair share in multiple spheres

- a) Legal safeguards against discrimination
- b) Policy for fair share, quota/ earmarking /population share: employment, education, legislations, housing, participation in governance/law/policy/implementation
- c) Lack of civil rights



Excluded Groups need dual policies (*continuation*)

- **Endowment Improvement**
- Policies to improve ownership of capital assets, land, and enterprise
- human resource, education, and skills



Dual policies inclusion in GESI

- **May consider inclusion in GESI ?**
- **Affirmative Action to factor in** Policies and projects under GESI
- Separate indicators to assess progress in legal safeguards, fair share, participation in governance,
- **Endowment improvement:** Land, enterprises, and education and skill policies
- **Non-discriminatory and disadvantage-reducing growth (Hann Karlson 2008)**
- ADB should take lead in GESI at UN level
- Similar to that of sustainable development goals/Inclusive growth /No one left behind/share in prosperity



Country example on policies

- Some countries developed policies and methods to overcome **discriminatory access/Endowment improvement** :
- **India** Constitution, (1950) legal safeguards, (1955) Reservation policy with share in public jobs ,education, legislature, public housing, farming, enterprises, (1950)
- Private sector, voluntary/self regulatory-2008
- Policies to **improve endowment**: land, enterprises, education, and housing.
- **Nepal** has some of these policies
- **Bangladesh and Sri Lanka** have some group-focused policies if not as much as India or Nepal.



THANKS

- These are some suggestions which I thought may benefit to further improve GESI framework with sound **justification from theories** of discrimination/exclusion and **empirical facts**.
- Prime agenda should be **research** on social Identity-based **discrimination, its nature, forms, its consequences**, and database, to reduce the zone of ignorance - help **evidence-based policies**
- **ADB may like to be more inclusive of researchers and Institutions** from social identity groups to receive experience-based knowledge

