Innovation in Skill Development in Secondary Education: Issues and Constraints

ADB OECD LEED Pre-Forum Workshop: Does Asia Need a Unique Model for Skills Development?
10 December 2012
Manila, The Philippines

Norman LaRocque
Senior Education Specialist
Asian Development Bank
nlarocque@adb.org

ADB

Context

- Skills development increasingly seen as key contributor to economic growth – impact on innovation and productivity
- Increasing and changing demand for skills in Asia:
  - New industries/FDI
  - New technologies
  - Changing nature of work
  - Government strategy/policy
  - Rapid economic growth
- Increasing diversification of TVET supply:
  - Secondary schools
  - Apprenticeships
  - Institutes of technology
  - Private sector
  - Fee-paying public institutes
  - Franchises

ADB

TVET Challenges

- Poor perception of TVET
- Access disparities and gender-based segregation
- High cost of TVET delivery
- Weak link between formal and informal TVET
- Outdated regulatory and funding frameworks
- Lack of practical focus
- Poor quality/relevance of training
- Low private and public sector investment in TVET
- TVET oversight fragmentation

ADB

TVET in Secondary Schools

- Around 100 years old in developed economies
- 1950s/1960s – perceived need for developing countries to expand investments in TVET
- General vs. vocational streams in secondary schools – latter often seen as ‘dead end’
- Later efforts sought to combine general and vocational – diversified secondary education
- Recent trends – differences across regions, reduced TVET enrolments in secondary schools, TVET taught at upper secondary
- Focus of ADB more on strengthening TVET in post-secondary institutions, though some exceptions

ADB

TVET Enrolments as a % of Total Secondary Education Enrolments, Selected ADB DMCs, 2009

Country	Proportion (%)	Country	Proportion (%)
Kazakhstan	25	Lao PDR	1
Kyrgyz Republic	14	Malaysia	16
Mongolia	26	Viet Nam	17
Tajikistan	10	Bangladesh	8
Uzbekistan	88	India	2
Cambodia	8	Nepal	2
China	44	Pakistan	10
Fiji	11	World	24
Indonesia	38		

Source: Global Education Digest 2011, UNESCO, p. 144-154.

ADB

Change in TVET Upper Secondary Enrolments as a Proportion of Total Upper Secondary Education Enrolments, by Region, 1999-2009

Region	Year		Change
	1999	2009	
Arab States	34	20	-14
Central and Eastern Europe	50	47	-3
East Asia and Pacific	43	38	-5
Latin America and Caribbean	24	21	-3
North America and Western Europe	31	26	-5
South and West Asia	4	4	-
Sub-Saharan Africa	9	16	+7
World	28	24	-4

Source: Global Education Digest 2011, UNESCO, p. 53.

ADB

ADB

Innovation

- No silver bullet to address issues of quality and relevance in TVET – what works in one country or one context may not work in another
- My view – essential ingredient to increasing responsiveness and relevance is to increase TVET-industry linkages
- Many types of linkages – skills strategy preparation, determination of TVET funding allocations, development of TVET programs and curricula, apprenticeships/on the job training, direct provision, QA/certification
- Broad policy design in line with advice from ILO/recent McKinsey report on education to employment

ADB

Innovation

- ILO argues that improved TVET-industry coordination can help address mismatch of skills:
  - Information on changing technologies, equipment used in the workplace, changes in the demand for skills, training relevance
  - Opportunities for internships or apprenticeships
  - Mechanism for systematic feedback to providers
- McKinsey report notes 2 common elements to that innovative and effective programs :
  - Close TVET-industry collaboration – eg. curriculum/program design, industry faculty for providers
  - Employers and providers work with their students early and intensely – eg. identifying future employees
- Examples: Career Academies (USA), K to 12 reform (Philippines)

ADB

Classifying PPPs in TVET

Industry Linkages

- Curriculum/program development
- Student/job placement
- Apprenticeships
- Staff exchanges
- Training of TVET instructors
- Applied research and consultancies
- Private representation on governing/advisory boards
- Centers of Excellence
- Private provision of equipment, land, staff, curriculum, etc
- Philanthropy

Infrastructure PPPs

- Private finance, design, construction and operation of teaching facilities and workshops
- Equipping and maintenance of workshops

Demand-side Financing

- Scholarships/training vouchers
- Incentives for private providers: free land, soft loans, subsidies, tax/ customs duty exemptions
- Introduce competitive contracting of course/ program delivery to private TVET institutes
- Private management of public TVET institutes

Support Services

- Private involvement in TVET strategy development - eg. national training agencies
- Private quality assurance systems
- Standard setting
- Skill certification
- Private information and testing services

ADB


មន្ទីរការងារ និង បណ្តុះបណ្តាលវិជ្ជាជីវៈខេត្ត
មជ្ឈមណ្ឌលបណ្តុះបណ្តាលវិជ្ជាជីវៈខេត្តសៀមរាប
SIEM REAP PROVINCIAL TRAINING CENTER (PTC)

Constraints

- What is policy objective – increased relevance? If so, can policy achieve its objective in DMCs?
- Overall government fiscal constraints – can countries afford to double-track TVET?
- Education and training sector governance – fragmented responsibility within TVET and between TVET/other subsectors
- Articulation between non-formal and formal education sectors – eg. lower secondary-upper secondary transition/drop-outs
- TVET perceptions
- Missing the market?

Constraints (Cont'd)

- Lack of National Qualifications Framework
- Regulatory framework not generally conducive to innovation/contracting:
  - Rigid employment conditions
  - Pay and benefits – core government sector
  - Requirement for registered teachers
- Funding framework represents constraint:
  - Low level of government funding to secondary schools in DMCs
  - Large capital investment required to outfit schools
  - Supply-side nature of funding systems
  - % of funding spent on teacher salaries – low operational and maintenance budgets

ADB

Constraints (Cont'd)

- Education vs. training philosophy – time-based vs. competency based, theory vs. practice, registered teachers vs. craftspeople
- Management/entrepreneurial capacity of secondary school leaders – business linkages, innovation, contracting
- Regulatory + funding constraints = limited ability to deliver job relevant TVET education in secondary schools:
  - Ability to attract suitable teachers:
    - Theoretical and practical skills
    - Flexible employment conditions
    - Competition with private sector for teachers
  - Capital investment requirements – equipment, facilities
  - Lack of funds/mindset to operate/maintain equipment /facilities
  - Modern curriculum

ADB

Conclusion

- TVET becoming a more important issue for governments in most ADB DMCs
- Need to address skill shortages and improve environment for skills development in DMCs
- Use of secondary education sector in TVET delivery requires careful thought – policy objective, appropriate mechanisms, etc
- Significant implications:
  - Regulatory and funding policy change – employment, financing
  - Mindset change – training vs. education, practical, operational
  - Capacity building – contracting, management, etc

ADB